

Open Research Online

The Open University's repository of research publications and other research outputs

The Fogg Triptych: Testimony of a case study to the society and artistic production of Venetian Crete

Conference or Workshop Item

How to cite:

Lymberopoulou, Angeliki (2018). The Fogg Triptych: Testimony of a case study to the society and artistic production of Venetian Crete. In: Cross-cultural interaction between Byzantium and the West, 1204-1669. Whose Mediterranean is it anyway? (Lymberopoulou, Angeliki ed.), Society for the Promotion of Byzantine Studies, Routledge, London, pp. 59–73.

For guidance on citations see [FAQs](#).

© [not recorded]



<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/>

Version: Accepted Manuscript

Link(s) to article on publisher's website:

<https://www.routledge.com/Cross-Cultural-Interaction-Between-Byzantium-and-the-West-12041669/Lymberopoulou/p/book/9781138000000>

Copyright and Moral Rights for the articles on this site are retained by the individual authors and/or other copyright owners. For more information on Open Research Online's data [policy](#) on reuse of materials please consult the policies page.

oro.open.ac.uk

THE FOGG TRIPTYCH

Testimony of a case study to the society and artistic production of Venetian Crete

Angeliki Lymberopoulou

As an art historian and field archaeologist, I chose to focus on an actual object, and use it as a case study to highlight the volume's theme. The object is an unpublished triptych currently in Sam Fogg's London-based gallery.¹ Its dimensions are modest – it measures $48.3 \times 20.4 \times 5$ cm (fully open) and $23.7 \times 20.4 \times 5$ cm (closed); it is a portable painting that was probably made for private use.

These modest dimensions are compensated for by the high quality of craftsmanship and intriguing iconography. Fully opened, the triptych presents us with the Byzantine Deesis, where Christ is depicted enthroned in the middle flanked by His mother, the Virgin Mary, to the left and His cousin and Forerunner, Saint John the Baptist, to the right. The central composition is accompanied by



Figure 4.1 Fogg triptych (open): Deesis (middle), Saint Francis (left wing), Saint Anthony of Padua (right wing), post-1453, egg tempera on wood, $48.3 \times 20.4 \times 5$ cm (fully open), Fogg Gallery, London

Photo: courtesy of Sam Fogg, London

two saints of the Roman Catholic Church who have been placed on the internal wings: Saint Francis of Assisi is depicted to the left and Saint Anthony of Padua is depicted to the right. They both wear the brown habit of the Franciscan order and they are both depicted full length and three-quarters, facing towards the right in the case of Saint Francis, and to the left in the case of Saint Anthony. Their symmetry is further emphasised by the objects they hold: Saint Francis has a book in his right hand and a cross in his left, while Saint Anthony mirrors this arrangement by holding a book in his left hand and a lily in his right. When the left wing is closed, its external face reveals the popular military saint, George, on horseback killing the dragon. The right wing shuts last, on top of the left and with it the triptych is fully closed; the viewer is then presented with the image of the *Mandylion*.

With the exception of this last representation, the figures on the triptych are set against a gold background. The background in the representation of the *Mandylion* is painted to look like porphyry, alluding to marble. All scenes/figures are accompanied by identifying inscriptions.

The iconography of the triptych merits a detailed discussion, primarily because the study of this and similar compositions sheds light on the artistic outcome of a cross-cultural interaction, symbiosis and dialogue between Byzantine and western cultures that occurred in a number of former Byzantine territories under Venetian



Figure 4.1a Fogg triptych (detail): Saint George on horseback killing the dragon (external left wing), post-1453, egg tempera on wood, Fogg Gallery, London

Photo: courtesy of Sam Fogg, London



Figure 4.1b Fogg triptych (closed): Mandylion (external right wing), post-1453, egg tempera on wood, 23.7 × 20.4 × 5 cm, Fogg Gallery, London

Photo: courtesy of Sam Fogg, London

and other western rule in the era following the sack of Constantinople in 1204 by the troops of the Fourth Crusade.² The most important colony for the Venetians in the Mediterranean remained the island of Crete, which they owned from 1204 until 1669³ and where their reign resulted in a prolific cultural interaction as reflected in the artistic production of the island, and predominantly in post-Byzantine Cretan icons. A number of details in this triptych, outlined below, suggest a provenance from Venetian Crete and date of origin post-dating the second half of the fifteenth century.

As mentioned above, the central panel of the fully opened triptych depicts the Byzantine Deesis (Fig. 4.1). Christ appears enthroned in the middle, flanked by the Virgin and Saint John the Baptist. This comprises a typical/standard Byzantine Deesis with its three main participants which can be depicted full length as here or, alternatively, in bust form.⁴ The Byzantine roots of the iconography are subtly underlined by the *chrysography* (gold striations) on Christ's garments, which is one of the main characteristics of His attire in Byzantine art.⁵ The function of this iconography is based on the idea that the Virgin and the Baptist, considered to be the main intercessors for the salvation of mankind, flank the Saviour in eternal supplication, specifically on behalf of souls at the Last Judgement.⁶ The owner of the triptych would have found comfort in the thought that his or her prayers were supported and presented to Christ in heaven by these intercessors of the Christian faith.⁷ All three figures are accompanied by identifying inscriptions written in red, capital Latin characters: Christ is identified with IS XRS (Jesus Christ); the Virgin Mary with MA DI (Mater Dei – Mother of God); and John the Baptist with S IOAN BAPA (Saint John the Baptist).

Although the iconographic subject in the central panel is rendered in the Byzantine style, the actual theme – prayers for the salvation of a faithful soul – reflects a wider Christian appeal, not confined to Orthodoxy.⁸ The internal wings flanking the central panel depict two saints of the Roman Catholic Church, the most important of the Franciscan order: Saint Francis and Saint Anthony of Padua.⁹ The brown-coloured habit they both wear is in accordance with the Order's constitution, which stipulates that the habit should be poor (probably suggesting unbleached and undyed).¹⁰ Saint Francis, identified by red capital letters in Latin – S FRANCISC (Saint Francis) – has been placed on the left. He bears the stigmata visible on both his hands and on the right side of his chest, but not on his feet. The stigmata, which Francis acquired during a vision of the crucified Christ, form the main identifying attribute of the saint.¹¹ He holds a cross in his left hand and a book in his right. Saint Anthony of Padua also holds a book in his left hand and a lily, his main attribute, in his right,¹² his identification further confirmed by an inscription in red, capital letters in Latin: S ANTONI S DE PANOVA (Saint Anthony of Padua). Both saints look at the viewer, thus forming a visual bridge between the faithful and their prayers and the salvation that lies in heaven as conveyed in the central panel. By depicting saints who engage with the contemplating believer, the actual function of the wings also acquires a spiritual dimension since they literally open up and invite the viewer into heaven above. The prominent placement of the two main Franciscan saints in this triptych would probably suggest a strong affiliation with the Franciscan order on the part of the owner. The presence of this particular order was very strong on the island of Crete, already by the early thirteenth century.¹³ It was believed that Saint Francis himself stopped on the island on his way to the Holy Land in 1219.¹⁴ The saint ended up being one of the most beloved Catholic saints among the Cretan Orthodox faithful as reflected in his portraits found in Orthodox churches¹⁵

as well as in the Greek version of his name – Fragkiskos (Φραγκίσκος) – that survives in the island to the present day.¹⁶

The wings are also painted externally. Following their closing sequence, it is the left that shuts first to reveal Saint George on horseback killing the dragon, identified by an inscription in red, capital Latin characters – S GEORGIUS (Saint George) (Fig. 4.1a). George is one of the most popular military saints for both Orthodox and Roman Catholic Christianity. His popularity rose with the Crusades and has never diminished.¹⁷ Here he is depicted in Byzantine armour killing a non-Byzantine dragon, since Byzantine art favours the representation of a dragon in the form of a snake.¹⁸ While the gold background is typical for Byzantine panel painting, the same cannot be claimed for the landscape and especially the mountains, which stylistically are removed from the way Byzantine art depicts ridges, with steep edges attached to each other at acute, sharp angles.¹⁹ Thus the representation of the saint combines Byzantine and western iconographical elements.

Once the right wing shuts on top of the left, the triptych is fully closed and the viewer faces a depiction of the *Mandylion*, with the head of Christ inscribed with Greek letters in gold IC XC – the abbreviation for Jesus Christ (Ι[ησοῦ]CΧ[ριστό]C) (Fig. 4.1b). While the legend of Christ's face imprinted on a cloth is popular among both Orthodox and Catholics, their respective accounts of its creation differ. Orthodox Christianity believes that Christ made an imprint of His face on a cloth and sent it to the first-century King Abgar of Edessa (present-day Urfa in south-eastern Turkey) who was then cured of his disease.²⁰ This story furthermore serves as a justification for the existence of icons, since Christ clearly did not object to a reproduction of His likeness.²¹ For the Roman Catholic Church, Christ's image was imprinted on a cloth on His way to Calvary, when one of the women in the crowd wiped His sweaty face; in the West the representation is known as the 'Veronica' after the woman who came to Christ's assistance.²² The quality of the image is reflected in her name – Veronica, Vera = true (image of Christ). The iconography the closed triptych presents is that of the Byzantine *Mandylion*²³ – although it could have worked equally well as a variation on the 'Veronica' in the eyes of a westerner (in western art the *Veil of Saint Veronica* is depicted both with and without a female who presents it to the viewers).²⁴

It could be suggested that the iconography of this triptych was specifically chosen for its familiarity to both the Orthodox and Catholic faithful, a possibility further highlighted by its combination of both Byzantine and western elements. The predominance of the gold background, used in Byzantine artistic production to depict a heavenly world with no specific characteristics, associates it with an icon. However, the Latin characters used for the majority of the inscriptions in conjunction with the presence of the two most important Franciscan saints (Fig. 4.1) would probably suggest that it was destined for a Roman Catholic of either Venetian or mixed-household descent. From the fourteenth century onwards mixed marriages – predominantly between upper-class Venetian colonists and local

ladies of aristocratic pedigree – became increasingly common, primarily because it presented the Venetians with a legal opportunity to acquire land on Crete and thus strengthen their colonial position.²⁵ At the same time, the linguistic bilingualism would probably support a provenance for both the triptych and its owner from one of the main centres on the north coast of the island, since the countryside was predominantly monolingual (a point that has been also highlighted for Cyprus).²⁶

The study of objects like the one discussed here has become increasingly popular in the last twenty-five years. The prolonged Venetian presence on the island, which provides a link between the artistic production on Crete and the European Renaissance, in combination with the fact that Dominikos Theotokopoulos – better known as El Greco – started his career in the island's capital, Candia, as an icon painter,²⁷ are two important factors that have propelled their popularity. And while there is a plethora of publications and exhibition catalogues presenting, assessing and discussing Cretan icons, this does not mean that the questions and issues related to this specific artistic production on the island after the fall of Constantinople to the Ottomans in 1453, have been answered. The growing interest in the field creates opportunities to revisit subjects and examine them from different perspectives. For example, the icon by Nikolaos Ritzos at the Byzantine Museum in Athens depicting the monogram JHS (*Jesus Hominum Salvator*) has been the subject of publications and papers in a quest to unpack its meaning and function.²⁸ There is still so much to consider and even more to learn, primarily because the circumstances of the production of such works are relevant to our present-day multicultural society. In other words, their study could enhance the comprehension of contemporary life. Conversely, it is far easier than it has ever been to explore different perspectives on past cultural developments. Scholarship has broken away from one-dimensional notions of cultural and artistic purity and from considering them a requirement for excellence. One of the most illustrious examples of this re-evaluation is the Renaissance: recent scholarship tends to approach it as a pan-European and even global phenomenon rather than as an Italian miracle centred on Vasarian Florence.²⁹

The dispute that led to the Schism in the Christian Church and divided it into Orthodox and Catholic branches in 1054 was prolonged and (still remains) complicated. It certainly constituted a stumbling block for cross-cultural relations in territories where the two groups of faithful co-existed. One of the major points of difference that stood (and still stands) out and with which the wider Christian population was (and still is) familiar is that while those of the Orthodox persuasion believe that the Holy Ghost of the Trinity can only derive from God the Father, the Catholics are convinced that it can also issue from the Son – the famous *filioque* that had been added to the creed in Rome apparently since the early eleventh century.³⁰

Attempts to bridge the gap were intense during the last years of the Palaiologan rule, and partly reflect the dying Empire's desperate need of a life-line. The Council of Ferrara-Florence in 1439 aimed at the Union of the Churches, which



Figure 4.2 Trinity, after 1439, egg tempera on wood, 35.5 × 62.5 × 2.7 cm, Temple Gallery, London

Photo: courtesy of Temple Gallery, Sir Richard Temple

was never achieved.³¹ Among the fervent believers in the cause was Cardinal Bessarion, whose endowment sponsored Unionist priests on Crete to promote the concept.³² Bessarion's initiative was unsuccessful on the island, primarily because these priests were regarded suspiciously by both the Orthodox and the Catholic communities.³³ Regardless, Cretan artistic production reacted to the Unionist attempt³⁴ and among the examples that reflect engagement with this pivotal theological issue are icons depicting the Holy Trinity, such as the one presently in the Temple Gallery in London.

The Temple Gallery icon is of portable size and rectangular landscape shape, not the commonest of shapes for panel painted icons. Centre stage is occupied by a long, backless, wooden throne of a golden colour, on which Christ and the Ancient of Days are seated. The figure to the right is identified by an inscription placed on either side of his head, in Greek, capital, gold letters outlined in red (Ο ΠΑΛΑΙΟC ΘΗC). 'Ancient of Days' as a description assigned to God the Father can be found in the Book of Daniel (7:9, 13, 22).³⁵ Between the two the Holy Ghost in the form of a dove with widespread wings has been placed, within two mandorlas with gold rays, an inner one in the shape of a diamond and an outer one in the shape of a square. It is identified by an inscription which combines capital and uncial gold Greek letters, outlined in red: ΤΟΑΓΙΟΝΙΝΑ (The Holy Spirit). All three bear cruciform nimbi, a type of halo exclusively reserved for Christ in Byzantine art, here visually underlying the unity of the Holy Trinity. The central composition is flanked by two tall, narrow buildings, one on either side. The one on the left is topped by a triangular roof and has five openings.

From the largest opening on the front side emerges the bust of the poet and saint Kosmas the Hymnographer (c. 675–c. 752; also referred to in the bibliography as Kosmas of Maiouma and Kosmas the Melode) – identified by capital, gold letters, outlined in red: ΚΟCΜΟΠΟΙΗΤΗC.³⁶ He holds an open scroll the text of which has not survived, wears an olive himation with a green chiton on top and bears a nimbus. He faces to the right, where from the front opening of the building on that side, the bust of Saint Joseph the Hymnographer appears (c. 812/818–c. 886). The latter is identified by capital, gold letters, outlined in red: ΙΩCΗΦΟΠΟΙΗΤΗC.³⁷ Mirroring Kosmas the Hymnographer, he faces to the left; wears an olive himation and a burgundy red chiton on top, which covers his head; bears a nimbus; and holds an open scroll. Only a fragment of the text in capital, black letters is still readable, rendering ‘Father, the Son with the Holy Spirit you are my God’ and ‘your dominion’.³⁸

Both Kosmas and Joseph addressed issues concerning the Holy Trinity³⁹ and it would probably have been enlightening had the full inscriptions on the scrolls survived, since they might have produced a clear statement regarding the stand this panel takes on the *filioque* dispute. The fragment still readable on Joseph’s scroll suggests that his text at least was relevant to the iconography of the icon. While the two hymnographers who flank the Trinity are primarily identified with Orthodoxy, this does not exclude the possibility that the message here may have been pro-Unionist. The Temple icon is not the sole example of this iconography;



Figure 4.3 Trinity (detail of the upper part of an icon depicting the Visitation), after 1439, egg tempera on wood, Private Collection

Photo: courtesy of AXIA – Yanni Petsopoulos

a number of other paintings – including monumental ones⁴⁰ – exist, although not always flanked by the same saints,⁴¹ and not always or necessarily promoting an anti-Union stand. For example, this iconography tops the upper part of an icon depicting the Visitation.

Here, however, the fact that the bottom of the panel presents a row combining both Orthodox and Catholic Church Fathers would suggest that this icon was probably produced in support of the Unionist cause.⁴² Still, it should be noted that in these representations the Ancient of Days and the Son are rendered differently, with God the Father invariably having white hair – probably alluding to the ‘pure wool’ mentioned in Daniel 7:9. The two figures are not depicted as identical to each other, as is instead the case, for example, in the representation of the Trinity in Enguerrand Quarron’s *Coronation of the Virgin* (presently in Villeneuve-lès-Avignon), which was commissioned during the siege of Constantinople in 1453 and the iconography of which has been connected to the Council of Ferrara-Florence (1438/39).⁴³

The aforementioned examples, from the Fogg triptych to the Temple icon, present a multi-angled approach to the relationship between natives and colonists on Crete as reflected through the artistic production on the island. The dynamics of religion at the time added a difficult twist to their interaction and therefore it is hardly surprising that nuanced manifestations of their dialogue have found expression within a religious context. While the whole of Latin Greece experienced cultural exchanges similar to those of Venetian Crete, reflecting their geographical, historical, social and economic circumstances, the long and relatively stable Venetian presence on the island presents us with a plethora of material to explore aspects of an interaction of paramount significance for our better understanding, appreciating, accepting and respecting our present multicultural society.

Notes

- 1 I would like to thank Sam Fogg and his colleagues for introducing me to this portable triptych and for allowing me to study it.
- 2 Queller and Madden, 1997; Moschonas, 2008. See also Georgopoulou, 2001.
- 3 For a concise summary of the history of Venetian Crete: Maltezou, 1988; Maltezou, 1991.
- 4 See the paper by Ágnes Kriza in this volume, pp. XXX–XXX (essay no. XXX).
- 5 Folda, 2009. *Chrysography* (lit. writing in gold) is a characteristic of Byzantine art that depends on the use and application of gold; see also Kazhdan, 1991, 986.
- 6 This is reflected in the numerous examples of the iconography that exist within the sanctuary apse, above the altar in monumental painting. Some indicative examples in Cretan churches include: *Chania*: Kopetoi, Holy Apostles (fourteenth century); Maza, Saint Nicholas (1325/26); Moni, Saint Nicholas (1315, date in the narthex); Palaia Roumata, Church of the Virgin (1359/60); Temenia, Christ the Saviour (fifteenth century); Trachiniakos, Prophet Elijah (fourteenth century); Tsourouniania, Saint George (1330–1339); Zymvragou, Saint Panteleemon (extended *Deesis*; late fourteenth century); *Rethymnon*: Argyroupoli, Saint Kyriaki (end of the twelfth century); Axos, Saint John the Baptist (end of the fourteenth century); Hagios Ioannis, Christ Saviour (c. 1400); Kato Poros, Saint John the Evangelist (first half

of the fourteenth century); Kentrochori, Saint John the Baptist (fourteenth century); Margarites, Saint John the Evangelist (1383); *Herakleion*: Archontiko, Chrysopigi (fourteenth century); Episkopi, Saint John the Baptist (second half of the fourteenth century); Lytto, Saint George (1321); Kapetaniana, Archangel Michael (mid-fourteenth century); Kastamonitsa, Saint Nicholas (fourteenth century); Koudoumas, Saint John the Baptist (fourteenth century); *Lassithi*: Kritsa, Saint John the Baptist (1389/90); Kroustas, Saint John the Evangelist (1347/48). The list is not exhaustive. A Leverhulme-funded international networks project, co-managed by the author of this paper and Prof. Dr Vasiliki Tsamakda (University of Mainz, Germany), examines the representations of sinners in Hell in Cretan churches and addresses the theme of the salvation of the soul (publication and database with material forthcoming; see <http://ledaproject.org.uk/wp-admin/>). The list of publications on Cretan frescoes is extensive and beyond the scope of this particular paper. For locating the abovementioned churches: Gerola and Lassithiotakis, 1961. For a detailed bibliography: Lymberopoulou, 2010, 370. To this list the following should be added: Andrianakis and Giapitsoglou, 2012; Spatharakis, 2001; Spatharakis 2010; Spatharakis and Van Essenber, 2012; and Spatharakis, 2015.

- 7 Lymberopoulou, 2007b, 82–3.
- 8 Ibid., 71–2.
- 9 The standard English-language history of the medieval order (to 1517) is Moorman, 1968.
- 10 I would like to thank Dr Clare Lappin for the invaluable help and advice she offered regarding the colour of the Franciscan habit. Neither the Franciscan Rule of 1221 nor that of 1223 (the latter accessible in <http://www.sacred-texts.com/chr/wosf/wosf06.htm>) mention the specific colour of the habit. In medieval art the colour of the Franciscan habit varies, but most often is depicted as either greyish-brown or grey (hence the Franciscans' nickname in the UK as 'Greyfriars'). Moorman, 1968, 359, quotes Bartholomew of Pisa's 'De Conformitate Vitae B.P. Francisco ad Vitam Domini Nostri Jesu Christi' (1380s/1390s), which describes Saint Francis' habit as 'ashy, pale and earth-coloured'. See also Armstrong, Hellmann and Short, 1999–2002.
- 11 Robson, 1999, 262–4; Ranoutsaki, 2011, 117–8.
- 12 Robson, 1999, 158–86.
- 13 Georgopoulou, 2001, 133–5.
- 14 Ibid., 133 and note 5 (on 310).
- 15 Ranoutsaki, 2011.
- 16 For the popularity of Saint Francis on Crete: Lassithiotakis, 1981, esp. 152–4.
- 17 Cormack, 2009, 69–75.
- 18 Indicative examples from Cretan churches of Saint George on horseback killing a snake include: *Chania*: Achladiakes, Saint Zosimas (fourteenth century); Anydroi, Saint George (1323); Argoule, Saint Paraskevi (fourteenth century); Asfentiles, Saint John the Evangelist (second quarter of the fourteenth century); Hagia Triada, Saint George (fourteenth century); Hagioi Theodoroi, Saint Photios (fourteenth century); Malatheros, Saint Eirini (fifteenth century?); Meskla, Christ the Saviour (Transfiguration) (1303); Palaia Roumata, Church of the Virgin (1393); Prodromi, Church of the Virgin (1347); Sarakina, Archangel Michael (beginning of the fourteenth century); Trachiniakos, Saint John the Evangelist (where Saints George, Demetrios and Theodore Stratelatis, all military saints, are depicted killing snakes) (1328/29); *Rethymnon*: Axos, Saint John the Baptist (end of the fourteenth century); *Lassithi*: Kritsa, Saint John the Baptist (1389/90); Kroustas, Saint John the Evangelist (1347/48); Voulismeni, Church of the Virgin (fourteenth century). The list is not exhaustive; for locating these churches, see note 6 above. Examples in Cretan monumental painting where the saint is depicted killing a dragon also exist, e.g. Cheliana, Saint George in Rethymnon (1319) and Lissos, Saints Kirikos and Iouliti

- in Chania (mid-fourteenth century). See also Vassilaki 1989; Walter, 2003, 109–44 (on Saint George) and 128, note 120 (on the form of the dragon/serpent).
- 19 For examples depicting the formation of mountains characteristic in Byzantine art/icons: Acheimastou-Potamianou, 1987, esp. 120 (no. 51).
- 20 Cameron, 1984; Guscini, 2009, 141–59; Spanke, 2000; Wolf, Dufour Bozzo and Calderoni Masetti, 2004. See also Bacci, 2014b; Spatharakis, 2010, 340 and note 226 (with extensive references); Peers, 2012; Tsakalos, 2013.
- 21 Kuryluk, 1991, 47–64. For an overview of the controversy over icon representation: Brubaker, 2010.
- 22 Ibid.
- 23 As seen in a number of Cretan churches, for example at *Chania*: Alikampos, Church of the Virgin (1315/16); Hagioi Theodoroi, Saint Photios (fourteenth century); Kakopetros, Archangel Michael (fourteenth century); Kefali, Christ the Saviour (1320); Kefali, Saint Athanasios (1393); Kitiros, Saint Paraskevi (1372/73); Malathiros, Saint Eirini (fifteenth century); Maza, Saint Nicholas (1325/26); Mertes, Saint Theodore (fourteenth century); Platanos, Saint Demetrios (fourteenth century); Trachiniakos, Saint John the Evangelist (1328/29); Ravdoucha, Saint Marina (fourteenth century); Voutas, Christ the Saviour (fourteenth century); *Rethymnon*: Axos, Saint John the Baptist (end of the fourteenth century); Cheliana, Saint George (1319); Garipas, Saint John the Baptist (beginning of the fourteenth century); Genna, Saint Onouphrios (1329/30); Hagia Triada, Church of the Holy Trinity (c. 1400); Hagios Ioannis, Church of the Virgin (c. 1300); Lampini, Saint George (twelfth/thirteenth century); Myrthios, Christ the Saviour (c. 1400); Rousospiti, Presentation of the Virgin (beginning of the fourteenth century); Saitoures, Church of the Virgin (c. 1300); Selli, Saint John the Evangelist (1411); Smiles, Church of the Virgin (beginning of the fourteenth century); Spili, Christ the Saviour (beginning of the fourteenth century); *Herakleion*: Ano Archanes, Asomatos (1315/16); Ano Archanes Saint Paraskevi (fourteenth century); Apano Symi, Saint George (1453); Drapeti, Saints Anne and Nicholas (beginning of the fifteenth century); Kassanoi, Christ the Saviour (three layers, dated from the late thirteenth to the early fifteenth centuries); Mikri Episkopi, Church of the Virgin (beginning of the fifteenth century); *Lassithi*: Meseleroi, Saint George (c. 1300). The list is not exhaustive; for locating these churches, see note 6 above.
- 24 See, for example, the works created by El Greco, *The Veil of Saint Veronica* (c. 1577–1580) and *The Holy Face* (1579); Marías, 2014, 212 (cat. 54) and 213 (cat. 55).
- 25 For Venetian Crete's society and households: McKee, 1995; McKee 2000.
- 26 See Tassos Papacostas' paper in this volume, XXX–XXX. For the language on Venetian Crete: Gasparis, 1994.
- 27 Panagiotakes, 2009.
- 28 Chatzidakis, 1974a, 99–100; Chatzidakis, 1974b, 176–7; Acheimastou-Potamianou, 1989–1990; Lymberopoulou, 2007a, 171–3; Newall, 2013, 126; Bacci, 2014a; Ritzerfeld, 2015. Anastasia Drandaki addressed issues related to this icon in the Dumbarton Oaks 2013 Byzantine Studies Fall Colloquium in her paper entitled 'Visualizing Community: City and Village in Byzantine Greece'.
- 29 See for example Woods, 2007; Richardson, 2007; Woods, Richardson and Lymberopoulou, 2007; Richardson, Woods and Franklin 2007. These books form the core module material of the course *Renaissance Art Reconsidered* (AA315) taught at the department of art history at The Open University, UK (life span 2007–2018).
- 30 Kazhdan, 1991, 1851. See also Runciman, 1955.
- 31 Kazhdan, 1991, 783.
- 32 For Bessarion: Bolick, 2013; for his bequest: Tsirpanlis, 1967.

- 33 Mpolanakis, 2002, 50–54.
 34 Ritzerfeld, 2014.
 35 Daniel 7:9: ‘I beheld till the thrones were cast down, and the Ancient of days did sit, whose garment was white as snow, and the hair of his head like pure wool’; Daniel 7:13: ‘I saw in the night visions, and, behold, one like the Son of man came with the clouds of heaven, and came to the Ancient of days, and they brought him near before him’.
 36 Kazhdan, 1991, 1152. See also Detorakis, 1979.
 37 Kazhdan, 1991, 1074. See also Tomadakis, 1971.
 38 Π(ατ)ήρ ὁ Υἱὸς / σὺν τῷ Πν(εύματ)ι / σὺ εἶ Θ(εός) μου
 ὁ Παντοκρά-/τορία σου.
 I would like to thank Dr Charalambos Dendrinis for transcribing this inscription and for his, as always, generous and invaluable assistance.
 39 Emery and Levering, 2011, 211.
 40 For example in the church of Christ the Saviour in the village of Sklavopoula, in the southwest part of the prefecture of Chania on Crete, which Spatharakis dates to c. 1400: Spatharakis, 1999, 204, fig. 351.
 41 For a detailed discussion by Lawrence Maxwell, see <http://www.templegallery.com/main.php?mode=3&p1=2331>. I would like to thank Mr Maxwell for discussing this icon extensively with me. (Please note that the description provided here is wrong in its identification of the hymnographers: Kosmas is on the left and Joseph on the right and the fragmentary surviving inscription appears on Joseph’s scroll.) See also Fleisch, 1981 (it is generally accepted that the signature of Michael Damaskinos in the icon depicting the Trinity at the Benaki Museum, Athens, is fake: Borboudakis, 1993, 541–2 [no. 194]).
 42 This icon is currently in a private collection, awaiting publication. I would like to thank Mr Yanni Petsopoulos for his invaluable help and advice and also for allowing me to reproduce a detail of this panel painting. Furthermore, Mr Petsopoulos informed me that this icon was in Florence until the 1930s, when it was transferred to the United States. It would be tempting to associate its production with the Ferrara-Florence Council in 1439 (although more evidence is required for such speculation).
 43 Denny, 1963.

References

- Acheimastou-Potamianou, M., (ed.), 1987, *From Byzantium to El Greco: Greek Frescoes and Icons* (London: Royal Academy of Arts)
 Acheimastou-Potamianou, M., 1989–1990, M. ΑχειμάστουΠοταμιάνου, ‘Δύο Εικόνες του Αγγέλου και του Ανδρέα Ρίτζου στο Βυζαντινό Μουσείο’, *Δελτίον της Χριστιανικής Αρχαιολογικής Εταιρείας* 15, ser. 4, 105–18
 Andrianakis, M.G., and Giapitsoglou, K.D., 2012, M.Γ. Ανδριανάκης, Κ.Δ. Γιαπιτσόγλου, *Χριστιανική Μνημεία της Κρήτης* (Herakleion: Συνοδική Επιτροπή Θρησκευτικού Τουρισμού της Εκκλησίας της Κρήτης – Μ.Κ.Ο. Φιλοξενία)
 Armstrong, R.J., Hellmann, J.W., and Short, W.J., (eds), 1999–2002, *Francis of Assisi: Early Documents*, 3 vols (New York: New City Press)
 Bacci, M., 2014a, ‘The Holy Name of Jesus in Venetian-Ruled Crete’, *Convivium* 1, 190–205
 Bacci, M., 2014b, *The Many Faces of Christ: Portraying the Holy in the East and West, 300–1300* (London: Reaktion Books)
 Bolanakis, I., 2002, I. Μπολανάκης, *Εκκλησία και Εκκλησιαστική Παιδεία στη Βενετοκρατούμενη Κρήτη* (Rethymnon: Ιερά Μητρόπολις Ρεθύμνης και Αυλοποτάμου)

- Bolick, L., 2013, *Culture, Humanism and Intellect: Cardinal Bessarion as Patron of the Arts* (unpublished PhD dissertation, The Open University, Milton Keynes)
- Borboudakis, M., 1993, Μ. Μπορμπουδάκης, *Εικόνες της Κρητικής Τέχνης (Από τον Χάνδακα ως την Μόσχα και την Αγία Πετρούπολη)* (Herakleion: Πανεπιστημιακές Εκδόσεις Κρήτης)
- Brubaker, L., 2010, 'Icons and Iconomachy', in L. James, (ed.), *A Companion to Byzantium* (Oxford: Wiley-Blackwell), 323–37
- Cameron, A., 1984, 'The History of the Image of Edessa: The Telling of a Story', in C. Mango and O. Pritsak, (eds), *Okeanos: Essays Presented to Ihor Sevcenko on his Sixtieth Birthday by his Colleagues and Students* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard Research Institute), 80–94
- Chatzidakis, M., 1974a, 'Essai sur l'école dite "Italogrecque" précédé d'une note sur les rapports de l'art Vénitien avec l'art Crétois jusqu'à 1500', in A. Pertusi, (ed.), *Venezia e il Levante fino al secolo XV*, 2 vols (Florence), vol. 2, 69–124 (figs 45–87)
- Chatzidakis, M., 1974b, 'Les débuts de l'école Crétoise et la question de l'école dite Italogrecque', in *Μνημόσυνον Σ. Αντωνιάδη* (Venice), 169–211 (pls Z–ΛΔ)
- Cormack, R., 2009, *Icons* (London: The British Museum Press)
- Denny, D., 1963, 'The Trinity in Enguerrand Quarton's Coronation of the Virgin', *The Art Bulletin* 45, no. 1, 48–52 (Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3048055>)
- Detorakis, Th., 1979, Θ. Δετοράκης, *Κοσμάς ο Μελωδός. Βίος και έργο* (Thessaloniki)
- Emery, G., and Levering, M., (eds), 2011, *The Oxford Handbook of the Trinity* (Oxford: Oxford University Press)
- Fleisch, J., 1981, 'The Role of Icon Painting in Theological Controversies: Michael Damaskinos' Trinity Concept', *Akten XVI Kongress*, II/6, 297–303
- Folda, J., 2009, 'Byzantine Chrysography in Crusader Art and Italian *Maniera Greca* Painting', in J.D. Alcheres with H. Evans and Th. K. Thomas, (eds), *Anathemata Eortika: Studies in Honor of Thomas F. Mathews* (Mainz am Rhein: Philipp von Zabern), 160–66
- Gasparis, Ch., 1994, Χ. Γάσπαρης, 'Η Γλώσσα της Βενετικής Γραφειοκρατίας. Η Αντιπαράθεση λατινικής και ελληνικής Γλώσσας στη Μεσαιωνική Κρήτη (13ος–15ος αι.)', *Σύμμεικτα* 9, 1 [Μνήμη Δ.Α. Ζακυθινού], 141–56
- Georgopoulou, M., 2001, *Venice's Mediterranean Colonies: Architecture and Urbanism* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press)
- Gerola, G., and Lassithiotakis, K.E., 1961, Giuseppe Gerola, *Τοπογραφικός Κατάλογος των Τοιχογραφημένων Εκκλησιών της Κρήτης* [*Elenco topografico delle chiese affrescate di Creta*], ed. and trans. K.E. Λασσιθιωτάκη (Herakleion)
- Guscin, M., 2009, *The Image of Edessa* (Leiden: Brill)
- Kazhdan, A.P., (ed.), 1991, *The Oxford Dictionary of Byzantium*, 3 vols (New York: Oxford University Press)
- Kuryluk, E., 1991, *Veronica and Her Cloth History, Symbolism and Structure of a "True" Image* (Cambridge, MA, and Oxford: Blackwell)
- Lassithiotakis, K.E., 1981, Κ.Ε. Λασσιθιωτάκη, 'Ο Άγιος Φραγκίσκος και η Κρήτη', *Πεπραγμένα του Δ' Διεθνούς Κρητολογικού Συνεδρίου (Ηράκλειο, 29 Αυγούστου–3 Σεπτεμβρίου 1976)*, vol. 2 (Athens), 146–54
- Lymberopoulou, A., 2007a, 'Audiences and Markets for Cretan Icons', in K.W. Woods, C.M. Richardson and A. Lymberopoulou, (eds), *Viewing Renaissance Art* (New Haven and London: Yale University Press), 171–206

- Lymberopoulou, A., 2007b, “‘*Pro anima mea*’”, but Do Not Touch My Icons: Provisions for Personal Icons in Wills from Venetian-dominated Crete’, in D. Stathakopoulos, (ed.), *The Kindness of Strangers: Charity in the Pre-Modern Mediterranean* (London: Centre for Hellenic Studies), 71–89
- Lymberopoulou, A., 2010, ‘Late and Post-Byzantine Art under Venetian Rule: Frescoes versus Icons, and Crete in the Middle’, in L. James, (ed.), *A Companion to Byzantium* (Oxford: Wiley-Blackwell), 351–70
- Maltezou, Chr., 1988, Χ.Α. Μαλτέζου, ‘Η Κρήτη στη Διάρκεια της Περιόδου της Βενετοκρατίας (1211–1669)’, in Ν.Μ. Παναγιωτάκης, (ed.), *Κρήτη: Ιστορία και Πολιτισμός*, vol. 2 (Herakleion: Σύνδεσμος Τοπικών Ενώσεων Δήμων & Κοινοτήτων Κρήτης), 105–61
- Maltezou, Chr., 1991, ‘The Historical and Social Context’, in D. Holton, (ed.), *Literature and Society in Renaissance Crete* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press), 17–47
- Marías, F., (ed.), 2014, *El Greco of Toledo: Painter of the Visible and the Invisible* (Fundación El Greco)
- McKee, S., 1995, ‘Households in Fourteenth-Century Venetian Crete’, *Speculum* 70, 27–67
- McKee, S., 2000, *Uncommon Dominion: Venetian Crete and the Myth of Ethnic Purity* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press)
- Moorman, J., 1968, *The History of the Franciscan Order* (Oxford: Clarendon Press)
- Moschonas, N., (ed.), 2008, Ν. Μοσχονάς, *Η Τέταρτη Σταυροφορία και ο Ελληνικός κόσμος* (Athens: Εθνικό Ίδρυμα Ερευνών, Ινστιτούτο Βυζαντινών Ερευνών)
- Newall, D., 2013, ‘Candia and Post-Byzantine Icons in Late Fifteenth-century Europe’, in A. Lymberopoulou and R. Duits (eds), *Byzantine Art and Renaissance Europe* (Farnham: Ashgate), 101–34
- Panagiotakes, N.M., 2009, *El Greco – The Cretan Years*, trans. J.C. Davis, pref. N. Hadjinicolaou, ed. R. Beaton (Farnham: Ashgate)
- Peers, G., 2012, ‘Mask, Marriage and the Byzantine Mandylion: Classical Inversions in tenth-century *Narratio de Translatione Constantinopol im Imaginis Edessanae*’, *Σύμμεικτα. Зборник радова поводом четрдесет година Института за историју уметности Филозофског факултета Универзитета у Београду* [Collection of Papers Dedicated to the 40th Anniversary of the Institute for Art History, Faculty of Philosophy, University of Belgrade] (Belgrade: Faculty of Philosophy, University of Belgrade), 45–54
- Queller, D.E. and Madden, T.F., 1997, *The Fourth Crusade: The Conquest of Constantinople* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press)
- Ranoutsaki, Chr., 2011, Χρ. Ρανουτσάκη, ‘Απεικονίσεις του Φραγκίσκου της Ασίζης στις εκκλησίες της Κρήτης’, in Μ. Andrianakis and Ε.Γ. Kapsomenos, (eds), *Πεπραγμένα Ι’ Διεθνούς Κρητολογικού Συνεδρίου (Χανιά, 1–6 Οκτωβρίου 2006)*, vol. Β3 (Chania), 111–34
- Richardson, C.M., (ed.), 2007, *Locating Renaissance Art* (New Haven and London: Yale University Press)
- Richardson, C.M., Woods, K.W., and Franklin, M.W., (eds), 2007, *Renaissance Art Reconsidered: An Anthology of the Sources* (Oxford and Milton Keynes: Blackwell Publishing in association with The Open University)
- Ritzerfeld, U., 2014, ‘Bildpropaganda im Zeichnen des Konzils von Florenz: Unionistische Bild motive im Kloster Baslamonero auf Kreta’, *Orientalia Christiana Periodica* 80, 387–407

- Ritzerfeld, U., 2015, 'In the Name of Jesus. The "JHS"-Panel from Andreas Ritzos and the Christian Kabbalah in Renaissance Crete', *Journal of Transcultural Medieval Studies* 2(2), 245–73
- Robson, M., 1999, *St Francis of Assisi: The Legend and the Life* (London: Geoffrey Chapman)
- Runciman, S., 1955, *The Eastern Schism: A Study of the Papacy and the Eastern Churches during the XIth and XIIth Centuries* (Oxford: Clarendon Press)
- Spanke, D., 2000, *Das Mandylyon. Ikonographie, Legenden und Bildtheorie der "Nicht-von-Menschenhand-gemachten Christusbilder"* (Recklinghausen: Museen der Stadt Recklinghausen)
- Spatharakis, I., 1999, *Byzantine Wall Paintings of Crete, vol. I: Rethymnon Province* (London: Pindar Press)
- Spatharakis, I., 2001, *Dated Byzantine Wall Painting of Crete* (Leiden: Alexandros Press)
- Spatharakis, I., 2010, *Byzantine Wall Painting of Crete, vol. II: Mylopotamos Province* (Leiden: Alexandros Press)
- Spatharakis, I., 2015, *Byzantine Wall Paintings of Crete, vol. IV: Agios Basileios Province* (Leiden: Alexandros Press)
- Spatharakis, I., and Van Essenber, T., 2012, *Byzantine Wall Paintings of Crete, vol. III: Amari Province* (Leiden: Alexandros Press)
- Tsakalos, A., 2013, 'Une représentation du "vrai" Mandylyon en Cappadoce?', *Δελτίον της Χριστιανικής Αρχαιολογικής Εταιρείας* 34, 107–16 [Περίοδος Δ. Στη Μνήμη του Τίτου Παπαμαστοράκη (1961–2010)]
- Tsirpanlis, Z.N., 1967, Z.N. Τσιρπανλής, *Το Κληροδότημα του Καρδινάλιου Βησσαρίωνος για τους Φιλενωτικούς της Βενετοκρατούμενης Κρήτης (1439–17ος αι.)* (Thessaloniki)
- Tomadakis, E., 1971, E. Τωμαδάκης, *Ιωσήφ ο Υμνογράφος. Βίος και έργον* (Athens)
- Vassilaki, M., 1989, 'A Cretan Icon of Saint George', *Burlington Magazine* 131, 208–14
- Walter, Chr., 2003, *The Warrior Saint in Byzantine Art and Tradition* (Aldershot: Ashgate)
- Wolf, G., Dufour Bozzo, C., and Calderoni Masetti, A.R., (eds), 2004, *Mandylyon Intorno al Sacro Volto da Bisanzio a Genova* (Milan: Skira)
- Woods, K.W., (ed.), 2007, *Making Renaissance Art* (New Haven and London: Yale University Press)
- Woods, K.W., Richardson, C.M., and Lymberopoulou, A., (eds), 2007, *Viewing Renaissance Art* (New Haven and London: Yale University Press)

Websites

- <http://www.templegallery.com/main.php?mode=3&p1=2331> (accessed 7 July 2017)
- <http://www.sacred-texts.com/chr/wosf/wosf06.htm> (accessed 7 July 2017)